

# PLANNING COMMITTEE

Wednesday, 19 April 2017

**PRESENT:** Councillor A. Lenny (Chair)

**Councillors:**

A.P. Cooper, D.B. Davies, I.W. Davies, J.A. Davies, T. Davies, W.T. Evans, W.J.W. Evans (In place of I.J. Jackson), J.K. Howell, M.J.A. Lewis, D.J.R. Llewellyn (In place of J.M. Charles), A.W. Jones, H.I. Jones, W.J. Lemon, K. Madge, M.K. Thomas and J.S. Williams

**Also Present:**

Councillor D.E. Williams who addressed the Committee in respect of Planning Applications W/34901 & W/34931

Councillor J. Thomas who addressed the Committee in respect of Planning Applications W/34736 & W/34737

**The following Officers were in attendance:**

J. Edwards, Development Management Manager

S. Murphy, Senior Solicitor

G. Noakes, Senior Development Management Officer [East]

J. Thomas, Senior Development Management Officer [South]

S.W. Thomas, Senior Development Management Officer [West]

K. James, Assistant Engineer Planning Liaison

K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer

**Chamber, County Hall, Carmarthen - 1.00 - 4.55 pm**

(NOTE: at 4.00 p.m. the Committee's attention was drawn to Council Procedure Rule 9 – Duration of Meeting and, as the meeting had been underway for three hours it was RESOLVED to suspend standing orders to enable the Committee to complete the business agendaed for that day. The Committee then adjourned for a 10 minute comfort break reconvening at 4.10 p.m.)

**1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors S.M. Allen, J.M. Charles, D.C. Evans and I.J. Jackson.

**2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTERESTS**

Councillor	Minute Number	Nature of Interest
J.S. Williams	8.2 - Planning Application S/34180 – New Cubicle housing for young stock (retrospective) at Cwmbereem Farm, Pontyberem, Llanelli, SA15 5BP	Knows both the applicant and objector

W.T. Evans	8.1 - Planning Application S/34640 – Erection of 1 no. 250kw wind turbine (45m tip height, 30m hub height) and associated infrastructure at land at Rhos Farm, Trimsaran Road, Llanelli, SA15 4RF	Knows both the applicant and objectors
Graham Noakes – Senior Development Management Officer (East)	7- Planning Application E/35287 – Remove part of front lawn to create car parking/turning area at 41 Parklands Road, Ammanford, SA18 3TD	Applicant

**3. S/35086 - ALTERNATIVE SCHEME FOR ONE DWELLING (RESUBMISSION OF S/34809 - REFUSED 06/01/2017) AT PLOT ADJACENT 15 HEOL DDU, PEN Y MYNYDD, TRIMSARAN, SA15 4RN**

The Development Management Officer (South) referred to the private site visit undertaken by the Committee earlier that day (Minute 4.1.2 of the Planning Committee held on the 21<sup>st</sup> March, 2017 refers) the purpose of which had been to view the partly constructed property in light of concerns expressed on behalf of third parties on its potential impact on adjoining residential properties. He referred, with the aid of powerpoint slides, to the written report of the Head of Planning which provided an appraisal of the site together with a description of the retrospective development, a summary of consultation responses received and information on the local and national policies which were relevant to the assessment of the application. The Committee was advised that the Head of Planning was recommending approval of the application for the reasons detailed within her written report.

Representations were received objecting to the retrospective application re-iterating the points detailed in the Head of Planning's report which included the following:-

- The property and extension, had been constructed without any thought to its impact on neighbouring properties
- The ground floor extension measuring 4.3m x5m x 9m had been constructed without planning consent
- The construction of the unauthorised extension to the same level as the bedroom windows of the adjacent property at no. 17 would adversely impact on both the privacy of the bedroom and every part of the rear garden of that property resulting in a loss of privacy detrimental to the enjoyment of the home and garden,
- The construction of the extension by reason of its size, depth, width, height and massing would have an unacceptable adverse impact on the amenity of the adjacent residential properties by reason of being intrusive, out of proportion, overlooking, loss of privacy and having an overbearing visual

- appearance,
- The amended roof terrace proposals were minimal and unacceptable in that they could easily be overcome by minor works facilitating the removal of the Juliette Balconies and re-instating access to the roof terrace area at a later date, which would require planning approval, possibly retrospectively
  - Whilst the neighbours expressed a preference for the removal of the ground floor extension, an assurance was sought that, if planning were to be granted, use of the roof terrace would never be permitted. Furthermore, the existing rear first floor French windows should be replaced with normal windows and a pitch roof erected over the extension replacing the current flat roof.
  - The proposed extension of the garden was outside approved development limits and, if approved, would result in encroachment into the open countryside
  - Concern was expressed on the possibility of future retrospective planning applications being sought for the erection of buildings in the paddock to the rear of the development
  - Additional concerns were expressed on the scale and overbearing impact of the proposed extension contrary to Policy GP1 of the Carmarthenshire Local Development Plan,
  - The overbearing nature of the extension on the rear garden of no. 15, by virtue of its height, would result in a significant loss of sunlight in the afternoon with a complete loss to the children's play area by 4.30 -5.00 p.m.
  - The proposal was considered to be contrary to Planning Policy Guidance Wales in that the scale of the development, as constructed, was out of proportion with, and bore no resemblance to the size and scale of neighbouring properties.

The Senior Development Management Officer (South) responded to the issues raised by the objectors. Having regard to the objector's concerns on the potential for the roof terrace element to be re-introduced, and their preference for the replacement of the proposed first floor rear French windows with fixed windows, views were expressed that the application should be deferred to enable officers to discuss that aspect with the applicants.

**RESOLVED that consideration of planning application S/35086 be deferred to enable discussions to be undertaken with the applicants on the feasibility of replacing the rear first floor French windows with fixed windows.**

**4. S/35189 - SITING OF TWO DETACHED DWELLING HOUSES AT LAND AT FORMER CWMBLAWD SAWMILLS, LLANNON ROAD, PONTYBEREM, LLANELLI, SA15 5NB**

The Development Management Officer (South) referred to the private site visit undertaken by the Committee earlier that day (Minute 4 of the Planning Committee held on the 6<sup>th</sup> April, 2017 refers) the purpose of which had been to view the site having regard to its planning history. He referred, with the aid of powerpoint slides, to the written report, and addendum, of the Head of Planning which provided an appraisal of the site together with a description of the development, a summary of consultation responses received and information on the local and national policies which were relevant to the assessment of the application. The Committee was advised that the Head of Planning was recommending refusal of the application for

the reasons detailed within her written report.

A representation was received in support of the application which included the following:-

- The proposal, if approved, would add to the existing small cluster of 8 properties situated along a main highway served by a local bus route and post box facility.
- The cluster of properties was situated 1.7km away from the main settlement of Pontyberem with access to a range of services including medical and shops etc
- It was considered the proposal complied with part 9.2.22 of Planning Policy Wales appertaining to small groups of housing in rural communities
- The developer had submitted amended access proposals to the site to improve the visibility splay onto the adjoining highway
- If approved, the applicant had intimated he would be prepared to consider making a financial contribution to the provision of affordable housing within the community.
- The site had sufficient room to accommodate a garden, parking facilities and turning circle

The Senior Development Management Officer (South) responded to the issues raised. Having regard to the above statement on a possible contribution to affordable housing, a view was expressed that the application should be deferred to enable officers to discuss that aspect with the applicant.

**RESOLVED that consideration of planning application S/35189 be deferred to enable discussions to take place with the applicant on the policy requirement that a financial contribution be forthcoming towards the provision of affordable housing.**

**5. W/34901 - DETACHED DWELLING HOUSE AT LAND AT MOUNTHILL, MOUNT PLEASANT, PENSARN, CARMARTHEN, SA31 2LJ**

The Development Management Officer (West) referred to the private site visit undertaken by the Committee earlier that day (Minute 5.3 of the Planning Committee held on the 6<sup>th</sup> April, 2017 refers) the purpose of which had been to view the site. He referred, with the aid of powerpoint slides, to the written report, of the Head of Planning which provided an appraisal of the site together with a description of the development, a summary of consultation responses received and information on the local and national policies which were relevant to the assessment of the application. The Committee was advised that the Head of Planning was recommending refusal of the application for the reasons detailed within her written report.

A representation was received in support of the application which included the following:-

- The proposed development had been designed to complement and not detract from the existing listed property at Mounthill
- The proposal involved the demolition of the listed boundary wall and its reinstatement set back from its existing line in order to improve access to the site. It did not involve the wall's complete removal

**RESOLVED that planning application W/34901 be refused for the reasons**

detailed within the Head of Planning's written report

**6. W/34931 - ALTERATIONS TO FRONT BOUNDARY STONE WALL TO FACILITATE A VEHICULAR ACCESS AT LAND AT MOUNTHILL, MOUNT PLEASANT, PENSARN, CARMARTHEN, SA31 2LJ**

The Development Management Officer (West) referred to the private site visit undertaken by the Committee earlier that day (Minute 5.3 of the Planning Committee held on the 6<sup>th</sup> April, 2017 refers) the purpose of which had been to view the site. He referred, with the aid of powerpoint slides, to the written report, of the Head of Planning which provided an appraisal of the site together with a description of the development, a summary of consultation responses received and information on the local and national policies which were relevant to the assessment of the application. The Committee was advised that the Head of Planning was recommending refusal of the application for the reasons detailed within her written report.

A representation was received in support of the application advising that the proposal did not seek the removal of the listed boundary wall merely, its relocation set back from its existing line to improve site access arrangements.

**RESOLVED that planning application W/34931 be refused for the reasons detailed within the Head of Planning's written report.**

**7. AREA EAST - DETERMINATION OF PLANNING APPLICATIONS**

**RESOLVED that the following planning applications be approved subject to the conditions detailed within the Report/addendum of the Head of Planning and or reported at the meeting:-**

E/32266	Proposed development of Phase 2 of the Cross Hands Economic Link Road between the East Strategic Employment Site and the A476Llandeilo Road with junctions to Black Lion Road, Norton Road, and Llandeilo Road, associated drainage and landscaping works together with the demolition of two properties with associated garages at 99 and 101 Norton Road, Penygroes at a corridor through pasture land, from East Strategic Employment Site to Llandeilo Road, crossing Black Lion Road and Norton Road.
E/34580	Demolition of existing school to be replaced with a residential development of 7 no. 2 storey dwellings together with an on-site bat roost structure at former Nantygroes CP School, Llandybie, Ammanford, SA18 3NZ
E/35287	Remove part of front lawn to create car parking/turning area at 41 Parklands Road, Ammanford, SA18 3TD (NOTE: Mr G. Noakes, Senior Development Management Officer (East) having earlier declared an interest in this application left the meeting during its determination by the Committee.

**8. AREA SOUTH - DETERMINATION OF PLANNING APPLICATIONS**

**RESOLVED**

**8.1 that the following planning application be approved subject to the**

**conditions detailed within the Report/addendum of the Head of Planning and or reported at the meeting:-**

S/34640	<p>Erection of 1 no. 250kw wind turbine (45m tip height, 30m hub height) and associated infrastructure at land at Rhos Farm, Trimsaran Road, Llanelli, SA15 4RF</p> <p>(NOTE: Councillor W.T. Evans having earlier declared an interest in this application vacated the Council Chamber and took no part in its determination by the Committee)</p>
---------	---

**8.2 that consideration of the following planning application be deferred to enable further discussions to be undertaken with the applicant and objectors in light of the representations received regarding the start time of operations at the farm, and delegated authority be granted to the Head of Planning to grant the application should an agreement, mutually suitable to all parties, be achieved**

S/34180	<p>New Cubicle Housing for young stock (retrospective) at Cwmerem Farm, Pontyberem, Llanelli SA15 5BP (NOTE: Councillor J.S. Williams having earlier declared an interest in this application made representations thereon and then vacated the Council Chamber taking no part in its determination by the Committee).</p> <p>Representations were received objecting to the retrospective application which re-iterated some of the points detailed within the Head of Planning's written report and included the following:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The objectors had moved to their current home, adjacent to the development, in 2004 when the site was not a working farm with no livestock kept at the property,</li> <li>• The farm building was located 30m and 50m distance respectively from the objector's rear garden and property.</li> <li>• Operations commence on site at 4.30 a.m. resulting in disturbance to the objector's amenity from the use of heavy machinery on site causing vibrations within their property.</li> <li>• Whilst it was accepted the applicant had endeavoured to address issues raised, the committee was requested to add a condition to the application stipulating a starting time of 6.00 a.m. to alleviate, to a certain extent, the detriment caused to the enjoyment of the objector's property by the current 4.30 a.m. start.</li> </ul> <p>The applicant outlined to the Committee the reason for the retrospective nature of the application which had arisen following changes required to be undertaken to the previous approved planning consent due to unsuitable ground conditions. He also confirmed that having been in discussion with the Council's Environmental Health and Public Protection Division regarding the neighbour's concerns he had replaced machinery at the farm. He requested the Committee to approve the retrospective application</p>
---------	--

	<p>on the basis the use of the building had not changed since the original planning consent granted in December 2015.</p> <p>The Senior Development Management Officer (South) responded to the issues raised.</p>
--	--

## 9. AREA WEST - DETERMINATION OF PLANNING APPLICATIONS

### RESOLVED

**9.1 that the following planning applications be approved subject to the conditions detailed within the Report/addendum of the Head of Planning and or reported at the meeting:-**

W/33620	Demolish 1920's Stone-Built Public House (The Red Dragon), Empty Since 2006. In a Poor State of Repair, fronting a main road at Red Dragon, Rhydcymerau, Llandeilo, SA19 7PS
W/35182	Construction of a Bridge and Wetlands System (retrospective) at land at Little Garness, Ledgerland Lane, Llanteg, SA67 8PX
W/35298	Change of use from dwellinghouse (C3) to house in multiple occupancy (C4) for up to 4 people at 37 Lime Grove Avenue, Carmarthen, SA31 1SW

**9.2 that the Committee be minded to approve the following planning application, contrary to the Head of Planning's recommendation, subject to the outcome of the referral of Planning Application W/34737 for Listed Building Consent to CADW, the Welsh Government's historic environment service:**

W/34736	<p>Change of use of former Chapel to Camera Shop. Works to include the removal of fixed pews, a large number of repairs to the existing building, the introduction of a new mezzanine floor and staircase, new internal security shutters to the ground floor windows, and the widening of an external doorway to the rear of the building at Zion Chapel, Mansel Street, Carmarthen, SA31 1QX</p> <p>A representation was received in support of the application in the following terms:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There were a number of vacant chapel and church buildings within Carmarthen, and the current proposal would prevent Zion Chapel falling into disrepair and ruin</li> <li>• It was considered the proposal complied with legislation appertaining to the protection of historic and listed building as set out in Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, Planning Policy Wales, Welsh Office Circular 61/96 together with CADW'S (The Welsh Government's Historic Environment Service) requirements</li> </ul>
---------	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The proposal would maintain and preserve the characteristics of Zion Chapel with works to the external fabric having already been undertaken, with the consent of the Council's officers,</li> <li>• Reference was made to the Head of Planning's requirement for the retention of some of the pews within the Chapel and examples cited of developments listed on Cadw's website where pews had been removed from chapels. The current proposal would retain some of the pews, but not within the existing main pew area</li> </ul> <p>The applicant's business was currently the largest independent camera retailer within Wales with an annual turnover of £7m. Approval of the application would result in the workforce increasing from 14-19.</p> <p>The Committee in considering the application, and the representation made, expressed concern that should the application be refused, as per the Head of Planning's recommendation, it could result in another building falling into disrepair. It was considered the application should be approved under policies EQ8, RT1, TR3 and SP8 of the Carmarthenshire Local Development Plan in addition to the national policies cited above</p>
--	--

**9.3 that as the Committee was minded to grant the following planning application for listed building consent, contrary to the recommendation of the Head of Planning, the application be referred to CADW, the Welsh Government's Historic Environment Service for determination:**

W/34737	Change of use of former Chapel to Camera Shop. Works to include the removal of fixed pews, a large number of repairs to the existing building, the introduction of a new mezzanine floor and staircase, new internal security shutters to the ground floor windows, and the widening of an external doorway to the rear of the building at Zion Chapel, Mansel Street, Carmarthen, SA31 1QX
---------	---

\_\_\_\_\_  
CHAIR

\_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

*Please note these minutes reflect the order of business itemised on the Agenda for the meeting which may differ from that on any webcast recording as applications with members of the public attending to speak, would have been dealt with first.*